Testing gravity with the two-body problem

ADRIEN KUNTZ

17/09/2020







THE GREEKS...



Introduction







JOHANNES KEPLER'S UPHILL BATTLE



KEPLER...





EINSTEIN'S GENERAL RELATIVITY (GR)

Post-Newtonian force

$$\mathbf{F} = -\frac{Gm_1m_2}{r^3}\mathbf{r}\left[1 + \mathcal{O}\left(\frac{v^2}{c^2}\right)\right]$$



EINSTEIN'S GENERAL RELATIVITY (GR)

Post-Newtonian force

$$\mathbf{F} = -\frac{Gm_1m_2}{r^3}\mathbf{r}\left[1 + \mathcal{O}\left(\frac{v^2}{c^2}\right)\right]$$



Gravitational Waves (GW)

$$P = \frac{G}{5} \left\langle \ddot{Q}^{kl} \ddot{Q}_{kl} \right\rangle$$



THE SOUND OF GRAVITATIONAL WAVES



Problematic

What can we learn from gravity using two-body trajectories ? Where should we look for new physics, and which parameters control possible deviations from GR ?

 \Rightarrow EFFECTIVE FIELD THEORY (EFT) ideas are crucial

Problematic

What can we learn from gravity using two-body trajectories ? Where should we look for new physics, and which parameters control possible deviations from GR ?

\Rightarrow EFFECTIVE FIELD THEORY (EFT) ideas are crucial

A simple example : Eddington parameters

$$g_{\mu\nu} dx^{\mu} dx^{\nu} \simeq -\left(1 - \frac{2GM}{r} + \frac{\beta}{r^2} \frac{2G^2 M^2}{r^2} + \dots\right) dt^2 + \left(1 + \frac{2GM}{r} + \dots\right) (dx^2 + dy^2 + dz^2) .$$

Today's constraints : $|\gamma - 1| \leq 2 \times 10^{-5}$ $|\beta - 1| \leq 8 \times 10^{-5}$

Introduction

WHY MODIFY GRAVITY ?

COSMOLOGICAL CONSTANT PROBLEM

HUBBLE TENSION







SCALAR-TENSOR THEORIES:

 $g_{\mu\nu}$ + φ

Introduction



1. The two-body problem in GR : An EFT approach



____/

1. The two-body problem in GR: an $\ensuremath{\mathsf{EFT}}$ approach

2. The two-body problem in Scalar-Tensor theories



- 1. The two-body problem in GR: an EFT approach
- 2. The two-body problem in Scalar-Tensor theories
- 3. Two-body problem and screening mechanisms



- 1. The two-body problem in GR: an $\ensuremath{\mathsf{EFT}}$ approach
- 2. The two-body problem in Scalar-Tensor theories
- 3. Two-body problem and screening mechanisms
- 4. EXTREME MASS RATIO INSPIRALS AND SCALAR HAIR



PIAN

- 1. The two-body problem in GR : an EFT approach A. Kuntz (PRD) 20
- 2. THE TWO-BODY PROBLEM IN SCALAR-TENSOR THEORIES

A. Kuntz, F. Piazza, F. Vernizzi (JCAP) 19

P. Brax, AC. Davis, A. Kuntz (PRD) 19

3. Two-body problem and screening mechanisms A. Kuntz (PRD) 19

P. Brax, L. Heisenberg, A. Kuntz (JCAP) 20

4. EXTREME MASS RATIO INSPIRALS AND SCALAR HAIR

A. Kuntz, R. Penco, F. Piazza (JCAP) 20

Basic ingredient of GR : the METRIC $g_{\mu\nu}$

Action principle (in vacuum): $S_{\rm EH} = \frac{M_P^2}{2} \int d^4x \sqrt{-g} R \implies G_{\mu\nu} = 0$

A POINT-PARTICLE in GR:
$$S_{\rm pp,A} = -m_A \int d\tau_A = -m_A \int dt \sqrt{-g_{\mu\nu}} \frac{dx_A^{\mu}}{dt} \frac{dx_A^{\nu}}{dt}$$



 $\frac{d^2 x^{\mu}_A}{d\tau^2} + \Gamma^{\mu}_{\nu\rho} \frac{dx^{\nu}_A}{d\tau} \frac{dx^{\rho}_A}{d\tau} = 0$

The two-body problem in GR

EFT approach : use field theory tools

Goldberger and Rothstein 06 Porto 06 + many others...

$$g_{\mu\nu} = \eta_{\mu\nu} + h_{\mu\nu}$$
$$\mathcal{O}(v^2) = \mathcal{O}\left(\frac{GM}{r}\right) \ll 1$$

EFT approach : use field theory tools

$$g_{\mu\nu} = \eta_{\mu\nu} + h_{\mu\nu} \implies S = S^{(2)} + S_{\text{int}}$$

GREEN FUNCTION or PROPAGATOR:

$$S^{(2)} = -\frac{1}{8} \int d^4 x \left[-\frac{1}{2} (\partial_{\mu} h^{\alpha}_{\alpha})^2 + (\partial_{\mu} h_{\nu\rho})^2 \right]$$

INTERACTION VERTEX:

$$S_{\text{int}} \supset m \int dt \ h_{00} , \qquad m \int dt \ h_{00}^2 , \qquad \int d^4x \ \partial^2 h^3$$

Goldberger and Rothstein 06 Porto 06 + many others...

The two-body problem in GR

The two-body dynamics is encoded in the EFFECTIVE ACTION :

 $e^{iS_{\text{eff}}[\mathbf{x}_1(t),\mathbf{x}_2(t)]} = \mathcal{D}h_{\mu\nu}e^{iS[\mathbf{x}_1(t),\mathbf{x}_2(t),h_{\mu\nu}]}$

REAL PART: CONSERVATIVE

MAGINARY PART: DISSIPATIVE

The two-body dynamics is encoded in the EFFECTIVE ACTION :



The two-body dynamics is encoded in the EFFECTIVE ACTION :

A RESUMMATION TECHNIQUE

A. Kuntz (PRD) 20

In the 1PN potential enter two types of vertex

A RESUMMATION TECHNIQUE

A. Kuntz (PRD) 20

In the 1PN potential enter two types of vertex

The first one can be resummed exactly !

$$S_{\text{pp,A}} = -m_A \int dt \sqrt{-g_{\mu\nu} v_A^{\mu} v_A^{\nu}} \qquad \Leftrightarrow \qquad S_{\text{pp,A}} = -\frac{m_A}{2} \int dt \left[e_A - \frac{g_{\mu\nu} v_A^{\mu} v_A^{\nu}}{e_A} \right]$$

with $e_A = \sqrt{-g_{\mu\nu} v_A^{\mu} v_A^{\nu}}$
... The worldline couplings are now LINEAR

 e_2 The two-body problem in GR

WORLDLINE PARAMETERS

A. Kuntz (PRD) 20

 e_1, e_2 obey an interesting quintic equation. In the static case : $e_A = \sqrt{-g_{00}}$ e_1 $f_1(e_1, r) \equiv (e_1^2 - 1)^2 \left(e_1 - \frac{2Gm_1}{r} \right) - \frac{4G^2m_2^2e_1}{r^2} = 0$ e_2 0.0 -0.1 $f(e,r)^{-0.2}$ 0.5 G_1^c r_c/GM 2.5-0.3= 3GM $2.6GM \simeq r$ 0.125 0.250 -0.4ν 0.20.40.60.81.0 1.20.0

They define an 'effective two-body horizon' !

This can be generalised to gauge-invariant quantities for circular orbits

The two-body problem in GR

1. The two-body problem in GR: an $\ensuremath{\mathsf{EFT}}$ approach

2. The two-body problem in Scalar-Tensor theories

$MODIFYING \ GR: {\sf SCALAR-TENSOR THEORIES}$

GR action:
$$S = \frac{M_P^2}{2} \int d^4x \sqrt{-g}R + S_m[g_{\mu\nu}, \psi_i]$$

A simple alternative to GR: $g_{\mu\nu}$ + ϕ

$$S_{\varphi} = -\frac{1}{2} \int d^4x \sqrt{-g} g^{\mu\nu} \partial_{\mu} \varphi \partial_{\nu} \varphi$$

Coupling of φ with matter, compatible with causality and equivalence principle:

CONFORMAL COUPLING

Focus first on

$$\tilde{g}_{\mu\nu} = A(\varphi)g_{\mu\nu}$$

A. Kuntz, F. Piazza, F. Vernizzi (JCAP) 19

$$S_{\rm pp} = -\int d\tau_A \ m_A(\varphi) = m_A \int d\tau \left(-1 + \frac{\varphi}{M_P} + \frac{\delta_A}{M_P} \left(\frac{\varphi}{M_P} \right)^2 + \dots \right)$$

DISSIPATIVE

CONFORMAL COUPLING

Focus first on $\tilde{g}_{\mu\nu} = A(\varphi)g_{\mu\nu}$

A. Kuntz, F. Piazza, F. Vernizzi (JCAP) 19

$$S_{\rm pp} = -\int d\tau_A \ m_A(\varphi) = m_A \int d\tau \left(-1 + \frac{\varphi}{M_P} + \frac{\delta_A}{M_P} \left(\frac{\varphi}{M_P} \right)^2 + \dots \right)$$

DISSIPATIVE

CONFORMAL COUPLING

Focus first on $\tilde{g}_{\mu\nu} = A(\varphi)g_{\mu\nu}$

A. Kuntz, F. Piazza, F. Vernizzi (JCAP) 19

$$S_{\rm pp} = -\int d\tau_A \ m_A(\varphi) = m_A \int d\tau \left(-1 + \frac{\varphi}{M_P} + \frac{\delta_A}{M_P} \left(\frac{\varphi}{M_P} \right)^2 + \dots \right)$$

CHARGE RENORMALISATION

A. Kuntz, F. Piazza, F. Vernizzi (JCAP) 19

$$S_{\text{int}} = -\int d\tau_A \ m_A(\varphi) = m_A \int d\tau \left(-1 + \alpha \frac{\varphi}{M_P} + \delta \left(\frac{\varphi}{M_P} \right)^2 + \dots \right)$$

Scalar-Tensor theories

DISFORMAL COUPLING

Scalar-tensor theories

DISFORMAL COUPLING

CIRCULAR TRAJECTORY P. Brax, AC. Davis, A. Kuntz (PRD) 19

$$L_{\rm dis} = 4\alpha^2 b \frac{G^2 m_1 m_2 (m_1 + m_2)}{M^2} \left(\frac{d}{dt} \frac{1}{r}\right)^2 \qquad I_{\rm dis} = 8\alpha b \frac{G m_1 m_2}{M^2} \frac{d^2}{dt^2} \frac{1}{r}$$

For circular orbits : $\dot{r} = 0!$

No contribution of the disformal coupling. This is intuitive because :

$$\int d\tau (\partial_{\mu}\phi v_{A}^{\mu})^{2} = \int d\tau \left(\frac{d\phi}{d\tau}\right)^{2}$$

In this case I showed that only radiation reaction effects contribute

$$\Rightarrow L_{\text{dis}} = \mathcal{O}(v^{14}), \quad I_{\text{dis}} = \mathcal{O}(v^{12})$$

Scalar-tensor theories

DISFORMAL COUPLING ELLIPTIC TRAJECTORY P. Brax, AC. Davis, A. Kuntz (PRD) 19

Monopole
$$I_{\text{dis}} = 8\alpha b \frac{Gm_1m_2}{M^2} \frac{d^2}{dt^2} \frac{1}{r}$$

Scalar-tensor theories

CONCLUSION PART 2

Main aspects of scalar-tensor theories, with respect to $\ensuremath{\mathsf{GR}}$:

- Bending of light and perihelion is different
- Dipolar radiation
- Violations of the strong equivalence principle

CONCLUSION PART 2

Main aspects of scalar-tensor theories, with respect to GR :

- Bending of light and perihelion is different
- Dipolar radiation
- Violations of the strong equivalence principle

Experimental tests are very stringent: the scalar coupling is small

 $\alpha \leq 10^{-2}$

A screening mechanism could explain such a small value

How to formulate the two-body problem with a screening Mechanism?

- 1. The two-body problem in GR: an EFT approach
- 2. The two-body problem in Scalar-Tensor theories
- 3. Two-body problem and screening mechanisms

K-Mouflage screening

$$S = \int d^4x \left[-\frac{(\partial \varphi)^2}{2} - \frac{1}{4\Lambda^4} (\partial \varphi)^4 + \frac{\varphi T}{M_P} \right]$$

For cosmological applications

 $\Lambda^2 \sim HM_P$

Equation of motion around a static source:

$$\varphi_0' + \frac{\left(\varphi_0'\right)^3}{\Lambda^4} = \frac{M}{4\pi M_P r^2}$$

K-Mouflage screening

$$S = \int d^4x \left[-\frac{(\partial \varphi)^2}{2} - \frac{1}{4\Lambda^4} (\partial \varphi)^4 + \frac{\varphi T}{M_P} \right]$$

For cosmological applications

 $\Lambda^2 \sim HM_P$

Equation of motion around a static source:

K-Mouflage screening

$$S = \int d^4x \left[-\frac{(\partial \varphi)^2}{2} - \frac{1}{4\Lambda^4} (\partial \varphi)^4 + \frac{\varphi T}{M_P} \right]$$

For cosmological applications

 $\Lambda^2 \sim HM_P$

Equation of motion around a static source:

$$\varphi_0' + \frac{\left(\varphi_0'\right)^3}{\Lambda^4} = \frac{M}{4\pi M_P r^2}$$

TWO-BODY PROBLEM

PERTURBATIVE EXPANSION BREAKS DOWN...

$$e^{iS_{\text{eff}}[\mathbf{x}_1,\mathbf{x}_2]} = \int \mathscr{D}[\varphi] e^{iS[\mathbf{x}_1,\mathbf{x}_2,\varphi]}$$

TWO-BODY PROBLEM A. Kuntz (PRD) 19

A NUMERICAL SOLUTION:

$$\eta = \frac{m_1}{m_1 + m_2}$$

Screening mechanisms

EP VIOLATION

A. Kuntz (PRD) 19

$$E = \mu \ b(\eta) \ \varphi_0(r)$$

 $\Rightarrow \vec{a} = b(\eta) \vec{\nabla} \varphi_0(r)$

A. Kuntz (PRD) 19

$$E = \mu \ b(\eta) \ \varphi_0(r)$$

$$\Rightarrow \vec{a} = b(\eta) \, \vec{\nabla} \, \varphi_0(r)$$

$$\delta r_{EM} \simeq 3 \times 10^{12} \left| \eta_{SE} \left(\frac{r}{r_*} \right)^{4/3} \right| \text{ cm}$$

This gives a constraint :

 \overrightarrow{a}_E

 \overrightarrow{a}_M

$$\eta_{SE} \left(\frac{r}{r_*}\right)^{4/3} \lesssim 10^{-13}$$

Since $\eta_{\rm SE} \simeq 10^{-6}$, the perihelion constraint is better:

$$\left(\frac{r}{r_*}\right)^{4/3} \lesssim 10^{-11}$$

Screening mechanisms

CONCLUSIONS PART 3

- Screening mechanisms naturally recover GR inside the solar system
- They lead to violations of the Equivalence Principle

There remains an important question:

How is the (two-body) motion of black holes modified in Scalar-tensor theories ?

- 1. The two-body problem in GR: an EFT approach
- 2. The two-body problem in Scalar-Tensor theories
- 3. Two-body problem and screening mechanisms
- 4. EXTREME MASS RATIO INSPIRALS AND SCALAR HAIR

THE NO-HAIR THEOREM

In GR, BH are very simple objects!

VS

A ton of complicated physics (composition, EoS...)

This can be generalised to modified gravity:

(also valid for more complicated Lagrangians)

EMRI & scalar hair

THE NO-HAIR THEOREM

However, it is easy to circumvent the assumptions of the theorem

	I Jacobson '99	II Babichev Esposito-Farèse '13	III Sotiriou et al. '14
Hair type	Environmental	Environmental	Secondary
Lagrangian	$L_1 = \frac{M_P^2}{2}R - \frac{1}{2}(\partial\varphi)^2$	$L = L_1 - \frac{1}{2\Lambda^3} (\partial \varphi)^2 \Box \varphi$	$L = L_1 + \bar{\alpha}\phi \left(R_{\mu\nu\rho\lambda}R^{\mu\nu\rho\lambda}\right)$ $-4R_{\mu\nu}R^{\mu\nu} + R^2$
Field	$\varphi(t, r) = qt + \beta_{\text{eff}} \varphi_0(r)$	$\varphi(t, r) = qt + \beta_{\text{eff}} \varphi_0(r)$	$\varphi(r) = \frac{Q}{r} + \mathcal{O}\left(\frac{1}{r^2}\right)$

The GW signals would then be quite different than in GR! EMRI & scalar hair 47

HAIR EXAMPLE II: CUBIC GALILEON

P. Brax, L. Heisenberg, A. Kuntz (JCAP) 20

 $K_t = 3\left(\frac{r_*}{r}\right)^{3/2}$ $K_r = 4\left(\frac{r_*}{r}\right)^{3/2}$

 $K_{\Omega} = \left(\frac{r_*}{r}\right)^{3/2}$

$$\varphi = qt + \bar{\varphi}(r) + \delta\varphi$$
$$g_{\mu\nu} = \bar{g}_{\mu\nu} + \delta g_{\mu\nu}$$

÷

QUADRATIC ACTION for fluctuations:

$$S = \int d^4x \frac{1}{2} \left[K_t (\partial_t \delta \varphi)^2 - K_r (\partial_r \delta \varphi)^2 - K_\Omega (\partial_\Omega \delta \varphi)^2 \right] + \frac{\beta_{\text{eff}}}{M_P} \delta \varphi T$$

Solve for the field using Green's function

$$\Delta \Phi \simeq 3.5 \times 10^{-7} \beta_{\text{eff}}^{3/2} \left(\frac{\Lambda}{10^{-12} \text{eV}}\right)^{3/2} \left(\frac{m_1}{50M_{\odot}}\right)^{-1} \left(\frac{m_0}{10^6 M_{\odot}}\right)^{-3/2} \left(\frac{\Omega_{\text{in}}}{10^{-3} \text{Hz}}\right)^{-21/6}$$

EMRI & scalar hair

A SYSTEMATIC APPROACH

UNITARY GAUGE: $\varphi(t, x) \rightarrow \overline{\varphi}(r)$ i.e $\delta \varphi = 0$

A SYSTEMATIC APPROACH

 $\int_{0}^{V \ll 1} \varphi = \bar{\varphi}(r) + \delta\varphi$ $g_{\mu\nu} = \bar{g}_{\mu\nu} + \delta g_{\mu\nu}$

UNITARY GAUGE: $\varphi(t, x) \rightarrow \overline{\varphi}(r)$ i.e $\delta \varphi = 0$

EFFECTIVE ACTION :
$$S = \int d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left[\frac{1}{2} M_1^2(r) R - \Lambda(r) - f(r) g^{rr} - \alpha(r) \bar{K}^{\mu}_{\nu} K^{\nu}_{\mu} \right] + S^{(2)}$$

G. Franciolini et al. 19

- Λ, f and α uniquely determined by the background $\bar{g}_{\mu\nu}$
- M_1^2 removable by a conformal transformation

$$g_{\mu\nu}^{(E)}(x) = g_{\mu\nu}^{(J)}(x)M_1^2(r)$$

$$S_{\rm pp} = -\int dt \,\mu \sqrt{-\bar{g}_{\mu\nu}} v^{\mu} v^{\nu} \rightarrow -\int dt \,\mu(r) \sqrt{-\bar{g}_{\mu\nu}} v^{\mu} v^{\nu}$$

EMRI & scalar hair

THE METRIC $g_{\mu\nu} = \bar{g}_{\mu\nu} + \delta g_{\mu\nu}$

Background:

$$\bar{g}_{\mu\nu} dx^{\mu} dx^{\nu} = -a^2(r) dt^2 + \frac{dr^2}{b^2(r)} + c^2(r) \left(d\theta^2 + \sin^2 \theta d\phi^2 \right)$$

E.g. for Gauss-Bonnet:

 $a^{2}(r) = 1 - \frac{2M}{r} + \frac{MQ^{2}}{6r^{3}} + \mathcal{O}(r^{-4})$ $b^{2}(r) = 1 - \frac{2M}{r} + \frac{Q^{2}}{2r^{2}} + \mathcal{O}(r^{-3})$ $c^{2}(r) = r^{2}$ (gauge choice)

THE METRIC $g_{\mu\nu} = \bar{g}_{\mu\nu} + \delta g_{\mu\nu}$ $\bar{g}_{\mu\nu} dx^{\mu} dx^{\nu} = -a^{2}(r)dt^{2} + \frac{dr^{2}}{b^{2}(r)} + c^{2}(r)(d\theta^{2} + \sin^{2}\theta d\phi^{2})$

E.g. for Gauss-Bonnet:

 $a^{2}(r) = 1 - \frac{2M}{r} + \frac{MQ^{2}}{6r^{3}} + \mathcal{O}(r^{-4})$ $b^{2}(r) = 1 - \frac{2M}{r} + \frac{Q^{2}}{2r^{2}} + \mathcal{O}(r^{-3})$ $c^{2}(r) = r^{2}$ (gauge choice)

Perturbations:

Background:

 $\delta g_{\mu\nu}$ transforms under $(i, j) = (\theta, \phi)$ diffs and under PARITY:

$$\delta g_{\mu\nu}^{\rm odd} \Leftrightarrow \Psi$$

THE ODD SECTOR

A. Kuntz, R. Penco, F. Piazza (JCAP) 20

GENERALIZED RW EQUATION

$$\frac{d^2\Psi}{d\tilde{r}^2} + (\omega^2 + V(\tilde{r}))\Psi = S$$

$$\frac{d\tilde{r}}{dr} = 1 + (\dots)\frac{M}{r} + \mathcal{O}\left(\frac{M}{r}\right)^2 \qquad \text{GENERALIZED TORTOISE COORDINATE}$$

$$V(\tilde{r}(r)) = -\frac{1}{r^2} \left(1 - \frac{2M}{r} \right) \left(l(l+1) - (\dots) \frac{M}{r} + \mathcal{O}\left(\frac{M}{r}\right)^2 \right) \quad \text{GENERALIZED RW POTENTIAL}$$

THE ODD SECTOR

A. Kuntz, R. Penco, F. Piazza (JCAP) 20

GENERALIZED RW EQUATION

$$\frac{d^2\Psi}{d\tilde{r}^2} + (\omega^2 + V(\tilde{r}))\Psi = S$$

$$\frac{d\tilde{r}}{dr} = 1 + (\dots)\frac{M}{r} + \mathcal{O}\left(\frac{M}{r}\right)^2 \qquad \text{GENERALIZED TORTOISE COORDINATE}$$

$$V(\tilde{r}(r)) = -\frac{1}{r^2} \left(1 - \frac{2M}{r} \right) \left(l(l+1) - (\dots) \frac{M}{r} + \mathcal{O}\left(\frac{M}{r}\right)^2 \right) \quad \text{GENERALIZED RW POTENTIAL}$$

Solution to the RW equation:

Poisson 93 Sasaki 94

$$\Psi(r) = \Psi_0(r) + (M\omega)\Psi_1(r) + (M\omega)^2\Psi_2(r) + \dots$$
$$P \propto \sum_{l,m} \left|\frac{d\Psi}{dt}\right|^2$$

EMRI & scalar hair

DISSIPATED POWER

A. Kuntz, R. Penco, F. Piazza (JCAP) 20

N. Yunes, F. Pretorius 09

DISSIPATED POWER

A. Kuntz, R. Penco, F. Piazza (JCAP) 20

Our approach bridges the gap between ppE and theory:

MODELED SEARCH WITH ADDITIONAL NON-GR COEFFICIENTS !

The even sector now needs to be done...

Outlook

- We have investigated on the TWO-BODY PROBLEM in several types of SCALAR-TENSOR THEORIES, often adopting an EFFECTIVE FIELD THEORY viewpoint.
- GRAVITATIONAL WAVES astronomy still in infancy. Interesting physics ahead !
- EFFECTIVE FIELD THEORIES are fantastic tools to compare theory & experiment
- THE OLDEST ACADEMIC PROBLEM OF PHYSICS IS STILL A SOURCE OF INSPIRATION!

Outlook

- We have investigated on the TWO-BODY PROBLEM in several types of SCALAR-TENSOR THEORIES, often adopting an EFFECTIVE FIELD THEORY viewpoint.
- GRAVITATIONAL WAVES astronomy still in infancy. Interesting physics ahead !
- EFFECTIVE FIELD THEORIES are fantastic tools to compare theory & experiment
- THE OLDEST ACADEMIC PROBLEM OF PHYSICS IS STILL A SOURCE OF INSPIRATION! THANK YOU !

THE BEST THESIS DEFENSE IS A GOOD THESIS OFFENSE.